

Meeting	Economy & Place Policy & Scrutiny Committee
Date	12 February 2020
Present	Councillors S Barnes (Chair), Daubeney (Vice-Chair), Baker [until minute 53], Douglas, Hook, Pearson and K Taylor

---

#### **47. Declarations of Interest**

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, or any prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary interests, that they might have in the business on the agenda. None were declared.

#### **48. Minutes**

Resolved:

- i. That the minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2019 be updated to include an amendment to minute 38 and be brought back for approval at the next meeting.
- ii. That the minutes of the meeting held on 15 January 2020 be updated to include the addition to minute 44 of it being suggested that HR may not be best placed to undertake HR interviews and be brought back for approval at the next meeting.

#### **49. Public Participation**

It was reported that there had been five registrations to speak on Agenda Item 6 Bi Annual Update from the Managing Director of Make It York (MiY). Kevin Tuohy, Nicholas Roberts, Alessandro Venturi, Robin George and Martin Spencer all spoke on that item.

Kevin Tuohy explained that in July 2019 assurances were sought regarding Jubbergate Market. Following this a working group had been set up and had met for the first time a few weeks previous. Mr Tuohy expressed concern regarding the conduct of MiY representatives at that meeting and he invited MiY to work with the market in a transparent and dignified way.

Nicholas Roberts explained that at Christmas, market traders had been forced into working prolonged hours due to being unable to exit the market. He noted that there had been a petition of 1500 signatures on this and that MiY had been going against market traders' human rights. He cited a number of examples of market traders with many years of trading that had left the market because of their treatment by MiY and he asked how many more traders the market would lose.

Alessandro Venturi, a former food market trader on Silver Street in the city centre explained his background as a chef and thanked Cllr Fitzpatrick and former Cllr Hayes for their support. He explained that he had a pitch on Silver Street where trading was no longer allowed and there was no longer the opportunity to trade in Silver Street. He suggested that MiY did not operate within market rules.

Robin George, Owner and Director of Roma Pasta Bar stated that he was perplexed by the treatment of MiY, which included a lack of communication. He expressed concern at being offered the pitch in Silver Street near some bins and he added that there was a lack of storage. He explained that there had been a breach in confidentiality by MiY disclosing market traders email addresses. He added that it was hoped that there would be resolution to market traders working with MiY.

Martin Spencer explained that MiY had consistently failed to communicate and the lack of attendance by MiY at the meeting demonstrated lack of communication from MiY with Councillors. He expressed concern about the promotional output for the Shambles Market and he added that MiY would not share their future plans for the market. He suggested that the edited 2015 draft market rates and regulations were only sent out to traders in 2019.

The Chair thanked speakers and stated that their comments had been noted.

## **50. Development of a new Economic Strategy**

Following the consideration of a report on developing York's economic strategy and partnership by the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning at his decision session on 17 October 2019, Members considered a report that provided an update in the development of a new Economic Strategy.

The Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning, Assistant Director for Regeneration and Asset Management and the Head of Economic Growth were in attendance to present the report. The Executive Member

advised that the new Economic Strategy was in development and there would be a transition in the jobs market. He added that the government was currently developing a new industrial strategy. The Head of Economic Growth gave a presentation on the York Economic Strategy 2020-2025.

Following the presentation, Members raised a number questions to which the Executive Member and officers responded that:

- With regard to a lack of resident representation on the My City Centre consultation and a lack of employee representation on the Economic Strategy consultation board, it would be good to have representation from different groups and this would be welcomed as part of the consultation.
- The view of market traders in relation to MiY was welcomed and the need to review the Service Level Agreement (SLA) was acknowledged, particularly in view of the support needed by businesses in leaving the European Union (EU).
- There would be a virtual network that would ensure that people could be involved in the consultation if they could not commit to attending meetings. The council wanted to make sure that a two way dialogue was established especially in regard to inclusive growth.
- There was a commitment in the Council Plan in relation to the role each group and governing body would play in the development of the economic partnership.
- In regards to the statistics used, the earnings of residents is higher compared to earnings by employment.
- It was hoped that the economic partnership would arise from the twelve groups included in the consultation. There was a desire to include all groups and a request for extra funding to facilitate this had been put forward.
- The Economic Strategy would be an ongoing process.
- In respect of including the outlying areas of the city, for example villages, farms and rural shopping areas, all geographical areas would be covered.
- With regard to York Central, the building use types in the planning application were specifically grade A offices and ancillary businesses and the council was looking to support small businesses in that mix. It was clarified that the council was contributing to the occupier strategy along with other York Central landowners.

- With regard to sustainable growth and reducing carbon emissions, there was a need to make better use of resources as a city and carbon counting would become a part of the process.
- Concerning the threshold for proposed use types in York Central, Permitted Development (PD) rights would last approximately 15 years.

The Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning, Assistant Director for Regeneration and Asset Management and the Head of Economic Growth were thanked for their update.

Resolved: That the update on the development of the new Economic Strategy be noted.

Reason: In order to be updated on the development of the new Economic Strategy be noted.

### **51. Inclusive Growth - Referral from Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee**

Members considered a report that advised them of a request by the Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee (CSMC) to consider a definition for “inclusive growth” along with the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning.

The Corporate Director Economy and Place, Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning and Head of Economic Growth were in attendance. The Head of Economic Growth gave a presentation on what was meant by inclusive growth.

Following the presentation a Member raised concern about the referral from CSMC Call-In meeting and she was advised to raise her concern with the Monitoring Officer. The rationale for the referral from CSMC Call-In was explained and it was explained that the discussion at this meeting would allow Members the opportunity to feedback their suggestions regarding inclusive growth and the economic strategy to the Executive. Suggestions were put forward regarding how inclusive growth would work as part of the economic growth strategy. The Member having raised concern previously then expressed further concern regarding the process for the CSMC Call-In resolution being brought to the committee meeting.

It was then:

Resolved: That the Chair seek assurance from the Chair of CSMC that the resolution from the CSMC Call-In meeting was being taken forward.

Reason: In order to clarify the resolution from the CSMC Call-In meeting.

## **52. Bi-Annual Update from the Managing Director of Make It York**

The Assistant Director Communities and Culture was in attendance as the client manager for MiY. He explained the formal reporting mechanism arrangements for MiY, which included but were not limited to a tri-annual contract review, SLA process and twice yearly report to the Shareholder Committee. He clarified that the council was the policy body for MiY.

The Chair expressed dissatisfaction that the MiY Managing Director had not attended the meeting and a Member expressed concern that the lack of a paper for the item negated the need to have a representative from MiY.

Members raised a number of points to which the Assistant Director Communities and Culture responded that:

- MiY was a wholly owned council company and was therefore not required to tender to the council.
- He would find out when the bicycle parking would be reinstated in Parliament Street.
- The market regulations were clear and set out the process by which MiY work with market traders and the council required MiY to work with market traders.
- There would be a review of the legal and health and safety documentation used by MiY in a constructive and consultative way. This included a full Terms of Reference which would be taken to the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning Decision Session in March, to be followed by a six monthly review.
- MiY should respond to emails.
- The MiY annual turnover was £4.8million with a net contribution of £290k from the council.
- In response to concern about the governance of MiY, MiY as a limited company had strict governance procedures.

- The Corporate Director Economy and Place clarified the role of the Shareholder Committee as a sub-committee of the Executive. Following a query about the mechanisms in place to ensure that the Board was meeting its obligations, he clarified the governance arrangements for a Teckal company.
- In response to a Member expressing disappointment that MiY were not in attendance at the meeting, the Chair clarified that the committee could make recommendations about the MiY SLA to the Executive.

Concerning the points raised by public speakers at the meeting, the Assistant Director Communities and Culture explained that he couldn't comment on individual disputes. The Corporate Director Economy and Place added that in regard to food traders in Market Street, this would be followed up with environmental health and clarified with MiY and stall holders. He acknowledged discussions regarding the Jubbergate market had taken place at the July committee meeting and there were ongoing matters relating to the Christmas market and noted the circumstances at MiY relating to their actions to both matters.

Resolved: That the MiY Managing Director be invited to a future meeting to present the bi-annual update to the Committee.

Reason: In order to receive the MiY bi-annual update.

### **53. 2nd Quarter Finance and Performance Monitoring Report**

This report provided details of the 2019/20 forecast outturn position for both finance and performance across services within the Economy and Place Directorate.

Resolved: That the report be deferred to a future meeting.

Reason: To update the Committee of the latest finance and performance position.

### **54. Pre-Decision Report on Public Electric Vehicle (EV) Charging Strategy**

As requested by the committee, Members considered a pre-decision report prior to the Executive's consideration of a report on Public Electric Vehicle Charging at their meeting in March.

The Assistant Director Transport, Highways and Environment and Head of Programmes and Smart Place were in attendance to present the report. An overview of the report was given and in answer to Member questions they responded that:

- Discussions were taking place regarding the pricing structure and the tariff would be used to pay for the power charge and running costs.
- At present there was a low take up of EV parking in York.
- The council was aiming for a minimum of 5% provision.
- The current EV parking arrangement was to pay for charging, not parking, which led to bay blocking. To incentivize against this there was to be investment in rapid and ultra charging. There would be a blend of these in the future.
- The council wanted to provide equality inclusiveness for EV charging.
- The statistics for the number of people working, parking and EV charging in York was not known and it was noted that there were issues with plug in hybrid vehicles.

Following discussion the following suggestions were put forward for consideration by Executive:

- Parking charges should be made on Fast charging (parking bay type) EV charging points;
- Free parking for residents at Fast chargers overnight;
- A penalty regime should be in place for rapid/ultra-rapid charging bays (service station type);
- Availability of EVs through car clubs;
- To continue to explore options for on street charging;
- Energy feeding the chargers should be from a renewable source;
- PPA should be from 100% carbon neutral resources

Resolved: That the following suggestions for the EV Charging Strategy be put forward for consideration by the Executive.

Reason: To ensure that there is a robust, resilient and inclusive approach to the development of public EV charging infrastructure.

## **55. Pre-Decision Report on Fleet Strategy**

As requested by the committee, Members considered a pre-decision report prior to the Executive's consideration of a report on Fleet Strategy at their meeting in March.

The Assistant Director Transport, Highways and Environment and Head of Highways and Fleet were in attendance to present the report. An overview of the report was given and in answer to Member questions they responded that:

- There was 256 under 3.5 tonne vehicles in the fleet of 565.
- Vehicles over 3.5 tonne were more bespoke items.
- The decisions regarding the fleet purchase were based in whole life cost – the bigger the vehicle the bigger the cost.
- With regard to the consideration on the carbon impact or alternative fuels there were concerns regarding biofuels and batteries and there were no perfect solutions as there was a carbon impact on the manufacturing process for these.
- Most vehicles in the fleet were run for 7 years.
- The move to the green energy tariff was noted.

Members considered the options as detailed in the report and two proposals were put forward as to whether the council should have a clear policy position that all new vehicles must be zero emission or whether this should apply to vehicles under 3.5 tonnes. Both proposals were seconded and it was:

Resolved: That it be suggested to Executive that the council have a clear policy position that all new vehicles must be zero emission.

Reason: To ensure that Fleet Strategy addresses the Council ambition of being zero carbon by 2030.

## **56. Work Plan 2019-20**

Members considered the work plan for the remainder of the municipal year.

Resolved:

- i. That it be delegated to the Chair and CSMC Chair to decide whether the committee receive an update paper on the CSMC Call-In on Inclusive Growth.



ii. That the work plan be updated to include the following items:

Wednesday 11 March 2020

1. Update report on Planning Enforcement.
2. Make It York's Economic Development Priorities for 20/21
3. Update report on Guildhall Project
4. Update report on Apprenticeships and Skills Scrutiny review
5. 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Finance and Performance Monitoring
6. Work Plan 2019-20

Wednesday 15 April 2020

1. Make It York update on Shambles market.
2. CYC Flood Defences Action Plan Biannual Report
3. Update Report on Highways (content to be informed by Cllr Taylor).
4. Update report on In-Work Poverty Scrutiny review.
5. Work Plan 2019-20

Wednesday 20 May 2020

1. Further Update Report on Implementation of Recommendations of Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review.
2. Work Plan 2019-20

Reason: To follow up on the decisions made at this meeting and to keep the work plan updated.

Cllr S Barnes, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 8.45 pm].